

ORAL ARGUMENT SCHEDULED FOR JUNE 2, 2016

**IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA CIRCUIT**

STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA, ET AL.,)	
)	
Petitioners,)	No. 15-1363 (and
)	consolidated cases)
v.)	
)	
UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL)	
PROTECTION AGENCY, ET AL.,)	
)	
Respondents.)	
_____)	

**JOINT PROPOSAL OF RESPONDENT EPA AND SUPPORTING
INTERVENORS CONCERNING FORMAT FOR ORAL ARGUMENT**

Pursuant to the Court’s March 28, 2016, letter, Respondents United States Environmental Protection Agency et al. (“EPA”) and Respondent-Intervenors (collectively “Respondents”) submit this proposed format for oral argument. Respondents consulted with Petitioners, and while the parties appear to collectively agree on certain aspects of the argument structure, they disagree on others. Respondents therefore submit this separate proposal.

Respondents propose that argument proceed in five phases with a total of 95 minutes per side for argument. Within that total, Respondents propose the following division of issues, presented in the proposed order that follows:

1. All statutory legal issues raised by Petitioners in their “Core Legal Issues” brief concerning EPA’s authority under Section 111 of the Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C. § 7411, to promulgate the challenged Rule, with the exception of the “Section 112” issue (30 minutes per side).
2. The Section 112 issue (i.e., whether EPA’s regulation of hazardous pollutant emissions under Clean Air Act Section 112, 42 U.S.C. § 7412, bars regulation of CO₂ emissions under Section 111(d)) (15 minutes per side).
3. The Tenth Amendment argument raised by Petitioners (10 minutes per side).
4. Procedural issues raised by Petitioners (10 minutes per side).
5. All other issues raised by Petitioners in their “Procedural and Record-Based Issue Brief,” except those identified below which are to rest on written submissions (30 minutes per side).

Respondents believe that the issues naturally break into the five discrete and identified segments identified above, with each segment covering a set of related issues or sub-issues. Respondents therefore propose that the argument be formally divided into these five segments, with argument on each segment to be completed by both sides before moving to the next. Respondents believe, however, that breaking the argument into more than the five argument segments proposed would lead to an inefficient use of judicial time and frustrate the Court’s ability to focus argument, within a group of related issues, on the sub-issues of particular interest to it.

Respondents acknowledge that the proposed argument length of 95 minutes of argument per side—three hours and ten minutes in total—is considerably longer than allotted in a standard case, but believe this amount of time is warranted given the increased word allotment for briefing, the large number of issues raised in this litigation and their scope, and the technical complexity of many of the issues. The proposed argument, however, could be completed in one day, and Respondents suggest that the Court does not need to schedule two days of argument.

Respondents’ proposed oral argument format is set forth in greater detail, along with the identification of counsel to present argument for Respondents, in the following table:

Issues	Time	Counsel Presenting Argument
All “core” statutory legal issues concerning Rule, other than the Section 112 issue <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pet. Core Legal Issue Op. Br. §§ I, III, Core Legal Issue Reply Br. §§ I, II, IV • EPA Br. § I 	30 minutes per side	Eric Hostetler (EPA) (20 min.) Michael Myers (State Int.) Kevin Poloncarz (Power Co. Int.) (total of 10 minutes to be divided among intervenors’ counsel)
Section 112 Issue (i.e., whether regulation of hazardous pollution under Section 112 bars regulation of CO ₂ emissions under Section 111(d)) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pet. Core Legal Issue Op. Br. § II, Core Legal Issue Reply Br. § III • EPA Br. § II 	15 minutes per side	Amanda Berman (EPA) (12 min.) Sean Donahue (Environmental Int. 3 min.)
Tenth Amendment issue <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pet. Core Legal Issue Op. Br. § IV, Core Legal Issue Reply Br. § V • EPA Br. § III 	10 minutes per side	Amanda Berman (EPA) (7 min.) Michael Myers (State Int.) (3 min.)

Procedural issues <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pet. Procedural and Record Op. Br. § I, Pet. Procedural and Record Reply Br. § I • EPA Br. § IV 	10 minutes per side	Chloe Kolman (EPA) (10 min.)
All record issues not submitted on briefs <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pet. Procedural and Record Op. Br. §§ II, IV.C.-D., V.A., V.D., Pet. Procedural and Record Reply Br. §§ II, III.D, IV at 33-34. • EPA Br. §§ V, VI.A-B., VII.B-C. 	30 minutes per side	Norman Rave (EPA) Brian Lynk (EPA) (total of 25 minutes to be divided among EPA counsel) ¹ Kevin Poloncarz (Power Co. Int.) (5 minutes) ²

Issues to Rest on Written Submissions

Respondents propose that the following record-based issues rest on the written submissions:

- Issues related to pre-2013 generating facilities and emission-rate credits, including North Carolina state-specific issue. Pet. Procedural and Record Opening Br. § III.A, B, V.F., Pet. Procedural and Record Reply Br. § III.A, EPA Br. § VII.A.
- Issue related to establishment of subcategories. Pet. Procedural and Record Op. Br. § IV.B, Pet. Procedural and Record Reply Br. III.C, EPA Br. § VI.C.

¹ Mr. Rave will address Petitioners' arguments concerning individual plant achievability analyses, interstate trading programs, grid reliability and infrastructure issues, and the state-specific issues raised by Wisconsin and Utah (EPA Br. §§ V.E-G, VI.A., VII.B-C.). Mr. Lynk will address Petitioners' arguments concerning the achievability of Building Blocks 1, 2 and 3, and EPA consideration of costs (EPA Br. §§ V.A-D, VI.B).

² If the Court has any questions regarding the issues addressed in the brief of the Trade Association Intervenors, Richard Ayres will be prepared and available to answer them.

- Issue related to new sources. Pet. Procedural and Record Op. Br. § IV.A, EPA Br. § VI.D.
- Issue related to enhanced oil recovery. Pet. Procedural and Record Op. Br. § III.C, Pet. Procedural and Record Reply § III.B, EPA Br. § VI.E.
- The state-specific issues raised related to Wyoming, New Jersey, and Arizona/Utah tribes. Pet. Procedural and Record Op. Br. § V.B, V.C., and V.E., Pet. Procedural and Record Reply § IV at 34-36, EPA Br. §§ VII.D, VII.E., p. 59.

Request Pursuant to Circuit Rule 34(c)

In view of the large number of issues to be argued and their complexity, as set forth in the above table, Respondent EPA respectfully requests leave for five counsel to appear for EPA—one to appear within each argument segment, except for the proposed 30-minute “record-issue segment,” in which EPA requests leave for two EPA counsel to appear. Respondents further request that limited time be allotted to three additional counsel representing State Intervenor-Respondents, Environmental and Public Health Organization Intervenor-Respondents, and Power Company Intervenor-Respondents respectively, as set forth within the table above.

WHEREFORE, Respondents respectfully request that the Court adopt the proposed oral argument format set forth above.³

³ Should the Court elect to structure the argument differently than Respondents propose, Respondents reserve the right to request that the Court allow them to reallocate time between Respondents’ attorneys in any differently organized or timed argument segments.

Respectfully submitted,

JOHN C. CRUDEN
Assistant Attorney General

April 28, 2016

/s/ Eric G. Hostetler
ERIC G. HOSTETLER
NORMAN L. RAVE, JR.
AMANDA SHAFER BERMAN
BRIAN H. LYNK
CHLOE H. KOLMAN
JONATHAN SKINNER-THOMPSON
U.S. Department of Justice
Environmental Defense Section
P.O. Box 7611
Washington, D.C. 20044
Phone: (202) 305-2326
Email: eric.hostetler@usdoj.gov

For Respondent EPA

Of Counsel:

Lorie Schmidt
Elliott Zenick
Howard J. Hoffman
Scott J. Jordan
Daniel Conrad
Nora Greenglass
Matthew Marks
Steven Odendahl
Zachary Pilchen
Aileen D. Roder
Daniel P. Schramm
Steven Silverman
Abirami Vijayan
United States Environmental
Protection Agency
Office of General Counsel
1200 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20460

FOR THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

KAMALA D. HARRIS
ATTORNEY GENERAL

Jonathan Wiener

M. Elaine Meckenstock

Deputy Attorneys General

California Department of Justice

455 Golden Gate Avenue, Suite 11000

San Francisco, CA 94102

(510) 622-2100

Attorneys for the State of California, by and through Governor Edmund G. Brown, Jr., the California Air Resources Board, and Attorney General Kamala D. Harris

FOR THE STATE OF CONNECTICUT

GEORGE JEPSEN
ATTORNEY GENERAL

Matthew I. Levine

Kirsten S. P. Rigney

Scott N. Koschwitz

Assistant Attorneys General

Office of the Attorney General

P.O. Box 120, 55 Elm Street

Hartford, CT 06141-0120

(860) 808-5250

FOR THE STATE OF DELAWARE

MATTHEW P. DENN
ATTORNEY GENERAL

Valerie S. Edge

Deputy Attorney General

Delaware Department of Justice

102 West Water Street, 3d Floor

Dover, DE 19904

(302) 739-4636

FOR THE STATE OF HAWAII

DOUGLAS S. CHIN
ATTORNEY GENERAL
William F. Cooper
Deputy Attorney General
425 Queen Street
Honolulu, HI 96813
(808) 586-1500

FOR THE STATE OF ILLINOIS

LISA MADIGAN
ATTORNEY GENERAL
Matthew J. Dunn
Gerald T. Karr
James P. Gignac
Assistant Attorneys General
69 W. Washington St., 18th Floor
Chicago, IL 60602
(312) 814-0660

FOR THE STATE OF IOWA

TOM MILLER
ATTORNEY GENERAL
Jacob Larson
Assistant Attorney General
Environmental Law Division
Lucas State Office Building
321 E. 12th St., Room 18
Des Moines, Iowa 50319
(515) 281-5351

FOR THE STATE OF MAINE

JANET T. MILLS
ATTORNEY GENERAL
Gerald D. Reid
Natural Resources Division Chief
6 State House Station
Augusta, ME 04333
(207) 626-8800

FOR THE STATE OF MARYLAND

BRIAN E. FROSH
ATTORNEY GENERAL
Thiruvendran Vignarajah
Deputy Attorney General
200 St. Paul Place, 20th Floor
Baltimore, MD 21202
(410) 576-6328

Attorneys for State of Maryland,
By and through Attorney General
Brian E. Frosh

FOR THE COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS

MAURA HEALEY
ATTORNEY GENERAL
Melissa A. Hoffer
Christophe Courchesne
Assistant Attorneys General
Environmental Protection Division
One Ashburton Place, 18th Floor
Boston, MA 02108
(617) 963-2423

FOR THE STATE OF MINNESOTA

LORI SWANSON

ATTORNEY GENERAL

Karen D. Olson

Deputy Attorney General

Max Kieley

Assistant Attorney General

445 Minnesota Street, Suite 900

St. Paul, MN 55101-2127

(651) 757-1244

Attorneys for State of Minnesota,
by and through the Minnesota Pollution
Control Agency

FOR THE STATE OF NEW HAMPSHIRE

JOSEPH A. FOSTER

ATTORNEY GENERAL

K. Allen Brooks

Senior Assistant Attorney General

Chief, Environmental Bureau

33 Capitol Street

Concord, NH 03301

(603) 271-3679

FOR THE STATE OF NEW MEXICO

HECTOR BALDERAS

ATTORNEY GENERAL

Tannis Fox

Assistant Attorney General

Office of the Attorney General

408 Galisteo Street

Villagra Building

Santa Fe, NM 87501

(505) 827-6000

FOR THE STATE OF NEW YORK

ERIC T. SCHNEIDERMAN

ATTORNEY GENERAL

Barbara Underwood

Solicitor General

Steven C. Wu

Deputy Solicitor General

Bethany A Davis Noll

Assistant Solicitor General

Michael J. Myers

Morgan A. Costello

Brian Lusignan

Assistant Attorneys General

Environmental Protection Bureau

The Capitol

Albany, NY 12224

(518) 776-2382

FOR THE STATE OF OREGON

ELLEN F. ROSENBLUM

ATTORNEY GENERAL

Paul Garrahan

Attorney-in-Charge

Natural Resources Section

Oregon Department of Justice

1162 Court Street NE

Salem, OR 97301-4096

(503-497-4593)

FOR THE STATE OF RHODE ISLAND

PETER F. KILMARTIN

ATTORNEY GENERAL

Gregory S. Schultz

Special Assistant Attorney General

Rhode Island Department of Attorney General

150 South Main Street

Providence, RI 02903

(401) 274-4400

FOR THE STATE OF VERMONT

WILLIAM H. SORRELL
ATTORNEY GENERAL

Nick Persampieri

Assistant Attorneys General

Office of the Attorney General

109 State Street

Montpelier, VT 05609-1001

(802) 828-6902

FOR THE COMMONWEALTH OF VIRGINIA

MARK HERRING
ATTORNEY GENERAL

John W. Daniel, II

Deputy Attorney General

Lynne Rhode

Senior Assistant Attorney General and Chief

Matthew L. Gooch

Assistant Attorney General

Environmental Section

Office of the Attorney General

900 East Main Street

Richmond, VA 23219

(804) 225-3193

FOR THE STATE OF WASHINGTON

ROBERT W. FERGUSON
ATTORNEY GENERAL

Katharine G. Shirey

Assistant Attorney General

Office of the Attorney General

P.O. Box 40117

Olympia, WA 98504-0117

(360) 586-6769

FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

KARL A. RACINE
ATTORNEY GENERAL
James C. McKay, Jr.
Senior Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
441 Fourth Street, NW
Suite 630 South
Washington, DC 20001
(202) 724-5690

FOR THE CITY OF BOULDER

TOM CARR
CITY ATTORNEY
Debra S. Kalish
Senior Assistant City Attorney
City Attorney's Office
1777 Broadway, Second Floor
Boulder, CO 80302
(303) 441-3020

FOR THE CITY OF CHICAGO

BENNA RUTH SOLOMON
Deputy Corporation Counsel
30 N. LaSalle Street, Suite 800
Chicago, IL 60602
(312) 744-7764

FOR THE CITY OF NEW YORK

ZACHARY W. CARTER
CORPORATION COUNSEL
Christopher G. King
Carrie Noteboom
Senior Counsel
New York City Law Department
100 Church Street
New York, NY 10007
(212) 356-2319

FOR THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

SOZI PEDRO TULANTE
CITY SOLICITOR

Scott J. Schwarz

Patrick K. O'Neill

Divisional Deputy City Solicitors

City of Philadelphia Law Department

One Parkway Building

1515 Arch Street, 16th Floor

Philadelphia, PA 19102-1595

(215) 685-6135

FOR THE CITY OF SOUTH MIAMI

THOMAS F. PEPE

CITY ATTORNEY

City of South Miami

1450 Madruga Avenue, Ste 202

Coral Gables, Florida 33146

(305) 667-2564

FOR BROWARD COUNTY, FLORIDA

JONI ARMSTRONG COFFEY

COUNTY ATTORNEY

Mark A. Journey

Assistant County Attorney

Broward County Attorney's Office

155 S. Andrews Avenue, Room 423

Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301

(954) 357-7600

David Doniger
Benjamin Longstreth
Melissa J. Lynch
Natural Resources Defense Council
1152 15th Street NW, Suite 300
Washington, D.C. 20005
(202) 513-6256
ddoniger@nrdc.org
*Counsel for Natural Resources
Defense Council*

Sean H. Donahue
Donahue & Goldberg, LLP
1130 Connecticut Avenue NW, Suite 950
Washington, D.C. 20036
(202) 277-7085
sean@donahuegoldberg.com
Counsel for Environmental Defense Fund

Tomás Carbonell
Vickie Patton
Martha Roberts
Peter Zalzal
Environmental Defense Fund
1875 Connecticut Avenue NW
Suite 600
Washington, D.C. 20009
(202) 572-3610
tcarbonell@edf.org
Counsel for Environmental Defense Fund

Joanne Spalding
Andres Restrepo
Alejandra Núñez
Sierra Club
85 Second Street, Second Floor
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 977-5725
joanne.spalding@sierraclub.org
Counsel for Sierra Club

Howard I. Fox
David S. Baron
Timothy D. Ballo
Earthjustice
1625 Mass. Ave., NW, Suite 702
Washington, DC 20036
(202) 667-4500
hfox@earthjustice.org
Counsel for Sierra Club

Ann Brewster Weeks
James P. Duffy
Clean Air Task Force
18 Tremont Street, Suite 530
Boston, MA 02108
(617) 624-0234, ext. 156
aweeks@catf.us
Counsel for American Lung Association, Clean Air Council, Clean Wisconsin, Conservation Law Foundation, and The Ohio Environmental Council

Vera P. Pardee
Kevin P. Bundy
Center for Biological Diversity
1212 Broadway, Suite 800
Oakland, CA 94612
(415) 632-5317
vpardee@biologicaldiversity.org
Counsel for Center for Biological Diversity

William V. DePaulo
122 N Court Street, Suite 300
Lewisburg, WV 24901
Tel: 304-342-5588
william.depaulo@gmail.com
Counsel for West Virginia Highlands Conservancy, Ohio Valley Environmental Coalition, Coal River Mountain Watch, Kanawha Forest Coalition, Mon Valley Clean Air Coalition and Keepers of the Mountains Foundation

Kevin Poloncarz
Donald L. Ristow
Paul Hastings LLP
55 2nd Street #2400
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 856-7000
kevinpoloncarz@paulhastings.com
*Counsel for Calpine Corporation, the
City of Austin d/b/a Austin Energy,
the City of Los Angeles, by and through its
Department of Water and Power, the City of Seattle,
by and through its City Light Department,
National Grid Generation, LLC, New York Power Authority,
Pacific Gas and Electric Company, Sacramento Municipal Utility District and Southern California
Edison Company*

Lawrence S. Robbins
Jennifer S. Windom
Daniel N. Lerman
ROBBINS, RUSSELL, ENGLERT, ORSECK,
UNTEREINER & SAUBER LLP
1801 K Street, N.W., Suite 411
Washington, D.C. 20006
Telephone: (202) 775-4500
lrobbins@robbinsrussell.com
Counsel for Advanced Energy Economy

Gene Grace
AMERICAN WIND ENERGY ASSOCIATION
1501 M St., N.W., Ste. 1000
Washington, D.C. 20005
Telephone: (202) 383-2500
ggrace@awea.org

Counsel for American Wind Energy Association

Richard Ayres
Jessica Olson
AYRES LAW GROUP LLP
1707 L Street, N.W., Suite 850
Washington, D.C. 20036
(202) 452-9200
ayresr@ayreslawgroup.com

John Bernetich
AYRES LAW GROUP LLP
1536 Wynkoop Street, Suite 528
Denver, CO 80202
(720) 504-3002
Counsel for Solar Energy Industries Association

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that copies of the foregoing Joint Proposal of Respondent EPA and Supporting Intervenors Concerning Oral Argument Format have been served through the Court's CM/ECF system on all registered counsel this 28th day of April, 2016.

/s/ Eric G. Hostetler
Counsel for Respondent