



State of West Virginia  
Office of the Attorney General

Patrick Morrissey  
Attorney General

(304) 558-2021  
Fax (304) 558-0140

September 23, 2016

VIA ELECTRONIC FILING

Mr. Mark Langer  
Clerk of the Court  
United States Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia Circuit  
E. Barrett Prettyman United States Courthouse  
333 Constitution Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20001

Re: *State of West Virginia, et al. v. EPA, et al.*, No. 15-1363  
(and consolidated cases)

Dear Mr. Langer:

The State and state agency petitioners (“States”) submit this letter under FRAP 28(j) to notify the Court of the consideration yesterday, September 22, 2016, by the California Air Resources Board of California’s proposed compliance plan for the Rule. *See* California’s Proposed Compliance Plan for the Federal Clean Power Plan, <https://www.arb.ca.gov/cc/powerplants/meetings/09222016/proposedplan.pdf>. In its proposed plan, California explains that it is proposing a “single state” plan, *id.* at 13, and—pursuant to California Government Code § 12894(f)—will link with another State’s emissions trading program only if the other State adopts “program requirements for greenhouse gas reductions . . . that are equivalent to or stricter than those required by” California law, and permits California to enforce the requirements against participating entities in the other State, *id.* at 21. California also explains that its

“reporting and verification system is significantly more rigorous than the [Rule] requires.” *Id.* at 28.

California’s actions support the States’ argument that EPA has failed to demonstrate that its national-average performance rates are achievable by each State. Pet. Record Br. 53-55. Because it is indisputable that many States—including Montana, Kentucky, North Dakota, and West Virginia—cannot meet EPA’s national performance rates by applying EPA’s claimed BSER within their own borders, the Rule is unlawful on that basis alone. *Id.* California’s actions illustrate the States’ further point that States who can over-comply with EPA’s performance rates can and may very well either refuse entirely to trade with States like Montana, Kentucky, North Dakota, and West Virginia, or force those States to adopt more stringent regimes than the Rule provides, as the price for “linkage” and compliance. *Id.* at 49-53.

Accordingly, although interstate trading is a non-BSER compliance measure that the agency cannot rely upon to justify its national-average performance rates, California’s actions support the States’ additional argument that, in any event, EPA has not demonstrated that sufficient interstate trading will emerge. EPA’s claim that a sufficient interstate program will emerge to enable nationwide compliance is an impermissible “crystal ball” prediction, *Portland Cement Ass’n v. Ruckelhaus*, 486 F.2d 375, 391 (D.C. Cir. 1973), which California’s actions further refute.

Dated: September 23, 2016

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Scott A. Keller

Ken Paxton

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

Jeffrey C. Mateer

First Assistant Attorney General

Scott A. Keller

Solicitor General

*Counsel of Record*

P.O. Box 12548

Austin, TX 78711-2548

Tel: (512) 936-1700

scott.keller@texasattorneygeneral.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Texas*

/s/ Elbert Lin

Patrick Morrissey

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WEST  
VIRGINIA

Elbert Lin

Solicitor General

*Counsel of Record*

J. Zak Ritchie

Assistant Attorney General

State Capitol Building 1, Room 26-E

Charleston, WV 25305

Tel: (304) 558-2021

Fax: (304) 558-0140

elbert.lin@wvago.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of West Virginia*

/s/ Andrew Brasher

Luther Strange

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ALABAMA

Andrew Brasher

Solicitor General

*Counsel of Record*

501 Washington Avenue

Montgomery, AL 36130

Tel: (334) 353-2609

abrasher@ago.state.al.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Alabama*

/s/ John R. Lopez IV

Mark Brnovich

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ARIZONA

John R. Lopez IV

*Counsel of Record*

Dominic E. Draye

Keith J. Miller

Assistant Attorneys General

Maureen Scott

Janet Wagner

Janice Alward

Arizona Corp. Commission,

Staff Attorneys

1275 West Washington

Phoenix, AZ 85007

Tel: (602) 542-5025

john.lopez@azag.gov

dominic.draye@azag.gov

keith.miller@azag.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner Arizona Corporation  
Commission*

/s/ Lee Rudofsky

Leslie Rutledge

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ARKANSAS

Lee Rudofsky

Solicitor General

*Counsel of Record*

Jamie L. Ewing

Assistant Attorney General

323 Center Street, Suite 400

Little Rock, AR 72201

Tel: (501) 682-5310

lee.rudofsky@arkansasag.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Arkansas*

/s/ Frederick Yarger

Cynthia H. Coffman

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF COLORADO

Frederick Yarger

Solicitor General

*Counsel of Record*

1300 Broadway, 10th Floor

Denver, CO 80203

Tel: (720) 508-6168

fred.yarger@state.co.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Colorado*

/s/ Jonathan L. Williams

Pamela Jo Bondi

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF FLORIDA

Jonathan L. Williams

Deputy Solicitor General

*Counsel of Record*

Jonathan A. Glogau

Special Counsel

Office of the Attorney General

PL-01, The Capitol

Tallahassee, FL 32399-1050

Tel: (850) 414-3818

Fax: (850) 410-2672

jonathan.williams@myfloridalegal.com

jonathan.glogau@myfloridalegal.com

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Florida*

/s/ Britt C. Grant

Samuel S. Olens

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF GEORGIA

Britt C. Grant

Solicitor General

*Counsel of Record*

40 Capitol Square S.W.

Atlanta, GA 30334

Tel: (404) 656-3300

Fax: (404) 463-9453

bgrant@law.ga.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Georgia*

/s/ Timothy Junk

Gregory F. Zoeller

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF INDIANA

Timothy Junk

Deputy Attorney General

*Counsel of Record*

Indiana Government Ctr. South

Fifth Floor

302 West Washington Street

Indianapolis, IN 46205

Tel: (317) 232-6247

tim.junk@atg.in.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Indiana*

/s/ Jeffrey A. Chanay

Derek Schmidt

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF KANSAS

Jeffrey A. Chanay

Chief Deputy Attorney General

*Counsel of Record*

Bryan C. Clark

Assistant Solicitor General

120 S.W. 10th Avenue, 3rd Floor

Topeka, KS 66612

Tel: (785) 368-8435

Fax: (785) 291-3767

jeff.chanay@ag.ks.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Kansas*

/s/ Joe Newberg

Andy Beshear

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF KENTUCKY

Mitchel T. Denham

Assistant Deputy Attorney General

Joseph A. Newberg, II

Assistant Attorney General

*Counsel of Record*

700 Capital Avenue

Suite 118

Frankfort, KY 40601

Tel: (502) 696-5611

joe.newberg@ky.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner Commonwealth of  
Kentucky*

/s/ Steven B. "Beaux" Jones

Jeff Landry

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF LOUISIANA

Steven B. "Beaux" Jones

*Counsel of Record*

Duncan S. Kemp, IV

Assistant Attorneys General

Environmental Section – Civil Division

1885 N. Third Street

Baton Rouge, LA 70804

Tel: (225) 326-6085

Fax: (225) 326-6099

jonesst@ag.state.la.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Louisiana*

/s/ Donald Trahan

Herman Robinson  
Executive Counsel  
Donald Trahan  
*Counsel of Record*  
Elliott Vega  
LOUISIANA DEPARTMENT OF  
ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY  
Legal Division  
P.O. Box 4302  
Baton Rouge, LA 70821-4302  
Tel: (225) 219-3985  
Fax: (225) 219-4068  
donald.trahan@la.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Louisiana  
Department of Environmental Quality*

/s/ Aaron D. Lindstrom

Bill Schuette  
ATTORNEY GENERAL FOR THE PEOPLE  
OF MICHIGAN  
Aaron D. Lindstrom  
Michigan Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
P.O. Box 30212  
Lansing, MI 48909  
Tel: (515) 373-1124  
Fax: (517) 373-3042  
lindstroma@michigan.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner People of the State of  
Michigan*

/s/ Monica Derbes Gibson

Monica Derbes Gibson  
Lesley Foxhall Pietras  
LISKOW & LEWIS, P.L.C.  
701 Poydras Street, Suite 5000  
New Orleans, LA 70139  
Tel: (504) 556-4010  
Fax: (504) 556-4108  
mdgibson@liskow.com  
lfpietras@liskow.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Louisiana Public Service  
Commission*

/s/ Harold E. Pizzetta, III

Jim Hood  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE STATE OF  
MISSISSIPPI  
Harold E. Pizzetta  
Assistant Attorney General  
Civil Litigation Division  
Office of the Attorney General  
Post Office Box 220  
Jackson, MS 39205  
Tel: (601) 359-3816  
Fax: (601) 359-2003  
hpizz@ago.state.ms.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Mississippi*

/s/ Donna J. Hodges

Donna J. Hodges

Senior Counsel

MISSISSIPPI DEPARTMENT OF

ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

P.O. Box 2261

Jackson, MS 39225-2261

Tel: (601) 961-5369

Fax: (601) 961-5349

donna\_hodges@deq.state.ms.us

*Counsel for Petitioner Mississippi Department of  
Environmental Quality*

/s/ Todd E. Palmer

Todd E. Palmer

Valerie L. Green

MICHAEL, BEST & FRIEDRICH LLP

601 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Suite 700

Washington, D.C. 20004-2601

Tel: (202) 747-9560

Fax: (202) 347-1819

tepalmer@michaelbest.com

vlgreen@michaelbest.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Mississippi Public Service  
Commission*

/s/ James R. Layton

Chris Koster

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF MISSOURI

James R. Layton

Solicitor General

*Counsel of Record*

P.O. Box 899

207 W. High Street

Jefferson City, MO 65102

Tel: (573) 751-1800

Fax: (573) 751-0774

james.layton@ago.mo.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Missouri*

/s/ Dale Schowengerdt

Timothy C. Fox

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF MONTANA

Alan Joscelyn

Chief Deputy Attorney General

Dale Schowengerdt

Solicitor General

*Counsel of Record*

215 North Sanders

Helena, MT 59620-1401

Tel: (406) 444-7008

dales@mt.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Montana*

/s/ Justin D. Lavene

Douglas J. Peterson

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NEBRASKA

Dave Bydlaek

Chief Deputy Attorney General

Justin D. Lavene

Assistant Attorney General

*Counsel of Record*

2115 State Capitol

Lincoln, NE 68509

Tel: (402) 471-2834

justin.lavene@nebraska.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Nebraska*

/s/ John R. Renella

Robert Lougy

ACTING ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NEW  
JERSEY

David C. Apy

Assistant Attorney General

John R. Renella

Deputy Attorney General

*Counsel of Record*

Division of Law

R.J. Hughes Justice Complex

P.O. Box 093

25 Market Street

Trenton, NJ 08625-0093

Tel. (609) 292-6945

Fax (609) 341-5030

john.renella@dol.lps.state.nj.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of New Jersey*

/s/ Sam M. Hayes

Sam M. Hayes

General Counsel

*Counsel of Record*

Craig Bromby

Deputy General Counsel

Andrew Norton

Deputy General Counsel

NORTH CAROLINA DEPARTMENT OF

ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

1601 Mail Service Center

Raleigh, NC 27699-1601

Tel: (919) 707-8616

sam.hayes@ncdenr.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner North Carolina  
Department of Environmental Quality*

/s/ Eric E. Murphy

Michael DeWine

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF OHIO

Eric E. Murphy

State Solicitor

*Counsel of Record*

30 E. Broad Street, 17th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

Tel: (614) 466-8980

eric.murphy@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Ohio*

/s/ James Emory Smith, Jr.

Alan Wilson

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF SOUTH  
CAROLINA

Robert D. Cook

Solicitor General

James Emory Smith, Jr.

Deputy Solicitor General

*Counsel of Record*

P.O. Box 11549

Columbia, SC 29211

Tel: (803) 734-3680

Fax: (803) 734-3677

esmith@scag.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of South Carolina*

/s/ Tyler R. Green

Sean Reyes

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF UTAH

Tyler R. Green

Solicitor General

*Counsel of Record*

Parker Douglas

Federal Solicitor

Utah State Capitol Complex

350 North State Street, Suite 230

Salt Lake City, UT 84114-2320

pdouglas@utah.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Utah*

/s/ Steven R. Blair

Marty J. Jackley

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF SOUTH  
DAKOTA

Steven R. Blair

Assistant Attorney General

*Counsel of Record*

1302 E. Highway 14, Suite 1

Pierre, SD 57501

Tel: (605) 773-3215

steven.blair@state.sd.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of South Dakota*

/s/ Misha Tseytlin

Brad D. Schimel

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WISCONSIN

Misha Tseytlin

Solicitor General

*Counsel of Record*

Andrew Cook

Deputy Attorney General

Delanie M. Breuer

Assistant Deputy Attorney General

Wisconsin Department of Justice

17 West Main Street

Madison, WI 53707

Tel: (608) 267-9323

tseytlinm@doj.state.wi.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Wisconsin*

/s/ James Kaste

Peter K. Michael

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WYOMING

James Kaste

Deputy Attorney General

*Counsel of Record*

Michael J. McGrady

Erik Petersen

Senior Assistant Attorneys General

Elizabeth Morrisseau

Assistant Attorney General

2320 Capitol Avenue

Cheyenne, WY 82002

Tel: (307) 777-6946

Fax: (307) 777-3542

james.kaste@wyo.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Wyoming*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that on this 23d day of September, 2016, a copy of the foregoing Federal Rule of Appellate Procedure 28(j) Letter was served electronically through the Court's CM/ECF system on all registered counsel.

/s/ Elbert Lin

Elbert Lin