

---

**ORAL ARGUMENT REMOVED FROM CALENDAR**

---

No. 15-1381 (and consolidated cases)

---

**IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA CIRCUIT**

---

STATE OF NORTH DAKOTA, *et al.*,

*Petitioners,*

v.

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY, *et al.*,

*Respondents.*

---

**On Petitions for Review of Final Agency Action of the  
United States Environmental Protection Agency  
80 Fed. Reg. 64,510 (Oct. 23, 2015) and 81 Fed. Reg. 27,442 (May 6, 2016)**

---

**SUPPLEMENTAL BRIEF OF PETITIONERS AND  
PETITIONER-INTERVENORS**

---

Wayne Stenehjem

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NORTH DAKOTA

Margaret Olson

Assistant Attorney General

500 N. 9th Street

Bismarck, ND 58501

Tel: (701) 328-3640

wstenehjem@nd.gov

maiolson@nd.gov

Paul M. Seby

Jerry Stouck

Special Assistant Attorneys General

GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP

1200 17th Street, Suite 24

Denver, CO 80202

Tel: (303) 572-6584

sebyp@gtlaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioner State of North Dakota*

Patrick Morrissey

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WEST

VIRGINIA

Elbert Lin

Solicitor General

*Counsel of Record*

Thomas M. Johnson, Jr.

Deputy Solicitor General

Katlyn M. Miller

Assistant Attorney General

State Capitol Building 1, Room 26-E

Charleston, WV 25305

Tel: (304) 558-2021

Fax: (304) 558-0140

elbert.lin@wvago.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of West Virginia*

**DATED: May 15, 2017**

*Additional counsel listed on following pages*

---

F. William Brownell  
Allison D. Wood  
Henry V. Nickel  
Tauna M. Szymanski  
Andrew D. Knudsen  
HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
Tel: (202) 955-1500  
Fax: (202) 778-2201  
bbrownell@hunton.com  
awood@hunton.com  
hnickel@hunton.com  
tszymanski@hunton.com  
aknudsen@hunton.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Utility Air Regulatory  
Group and American Public Power Association*

Geoffrey K. Barnes  
Wendlene M. Lavey  
John D. Lazzaretti  
Robert D. Cheren  
SQUIRE PATTON BOGGS (US) LLP  
4900 Key Tower  
127 Public Square  
Cleveland, OH 44114  
Tel: (216) 479-8646  
geoffrey.barnes@squirepb.com  
wendy.lavey@squirepb.com  
john.lazzaretti@squirepb.com  
bobby.cheren@squirepb.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Murray Energy  
Corporation*

Steven T. Marshall  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ALABAMA  
Andrew Brasher  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
501 Washington Avenue  
Montgomery, AL 36130  
Tel: (334) 353-2609  
abrasher@ago.state.al.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Alabama*

Mark Brnovich  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ARIZONA  
Dominic E. Draye  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Keith J. Miller  
Assistant Solicitor General  
Maureen Scott  
Janet Wagner  
Arizona Corporation Commission,  
Staff Attorneys  
1275 West Washington Street  
Phoenix, AZ 85007-2997  
Tel: (602) 542-3333  
Fax: (602) 542-8308  
dominic.draye@azag.gov  
keith.miller@azag.gov  
SolicitorGeneral@azag.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner Arizona Corporation  
Commission*

Tristan L. Duncan  
Thomas J. Grever  
SHOOK HARDY & BACON L.L.P.  
2555 Grand Boulevard  
Kansas City, MO 64018  
Tel: (816) 474-6550  
Fax: (816) 421-5547  
tlduncan@shb.com  
tgrever@shb.com

Jonathan S. Massey  
MASSEY & GAIL, LLP  
1325 G Street, N.W., Suite 500  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Tel: (202) 652-4511  
Fax: (312) 379-0467  
jmassey@masseygail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Peabody Energy  
Corporation*

Eugene M. Trisko  
LAW OFFICES OF EUGENE M. TRISKO  
P.O. Box 596  
Berkeley Springs, WV 25411  
Tel: (304) 258-1977  
Tel: (301) 639-5238 (cell)  
emtrisko7@gmail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner International Brotherhood  
of Boilermakers, Iron Ship Builders,  
Blacksmiths, Forgers & Helpers, AFL-CIO*

Leslie Rutledge  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ARKANSAS  
Lee Rudofsky  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Nicholas J. Bronni  
Deputy Solicitor General  
Jamie L. Ewing  
Assistant Attorney General  
323 Center Street, Suite 400  
Little Rock, AR 72201  
Tel: (501) 682-5310  
lee.rudofsky@arkansasag.gov  
jamie.ewing@arkansasag.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Arkansas*

Pamela Jo Bondi  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF FLORIDA  
Jonathan L. Williams  
Deputy Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Jonathan A. Glogau  
Special Counsel  
Office of the Attorney General  
PL-01, The Capitol  
Tallahassee, FL 32399-1050  
Tel: (850) 414-3818  
Fax: (850) 410-2672  
jonathan.williams@myfloridalegal.com  
jonathan.glogau@myfloridalegal.com

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Florida*

Grant F. Crandall  
General Counsel  
UNITED MINE WORKERS OF AMERICA  
18354 Quantico Gateway Drive  
Triangle, VA 22172  
Tel: (703) 291-2429  
gcrandall@umwa.org

Arthur Traynor, III  
Staff Counsel  
UNITED MINE WORKERS OF AMERICA  
18354 Quantico Gateway Drive  
Triangle, VA 22172  
Tel: (703) 291-2457  
atraynor@umwa.org

Eugene M. Trisko  
LAW OFFICES OF EUGENE M. TRISKO  
P.O. Box 596  
Berkeley Springs, WV 25411  
Tel: (304) 258-1977  
emtrisko7@gmail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner United Mine Workers of  
America, AFL-CIO*

Christopher M. Carr  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF GEORGIA  
Sarah Hawkins Warren  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Office of the Attorney General  
40 Capitol Square S.W.  
Atlanta, GA 30334-1300  
Tel: (404) 463-0070  
Fax: (404) 657-8773  
swarren@law.ga.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Georgia*

Stacey Turner  
SOUTHERN COMPANY SERVICES, INC.  
600 18th Street North  
BIN 14N-8195  
Birmingham, AL 35203  
Tel: (205) 257-2923  
staturner@southernco.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Alabama Power Company, Georgia Power Company, Gulf Power Company, Mississippi Power Company, and Southern Power Company*

C. Grady Moore III  
Steven G. McKinney  
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP  
1901 Sixth Avenue North, Suite 1500  
Birmingham, AL 35303-4642  
Tel: (205) 251-8100  
Fax: (205) 488-5704  
gmoore@balch.com  
smckinney@balch.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Alabama Power Company*

Curtis T. Hill, Jr.  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF INDIANA  
Thomas M. Fisher  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Office of the Attorney General  
Indiana Government Ctr. South  
Fifth Floor  
302 West Washington Street  
Indianapolis, IN 46204-2770  
Tel: (317) 232-6255  
Fax: (317) 232-7979  
tom.fisher@atg.in.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Indiana*

Derek Schmidt  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF KANSAS  
Jeffrey A. Chanay  
Chief Deputy Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Bryan C. Clark  
Assistant Solicitor General  
120 S.W. 10th Avenue, 3rd Floor  
Topeka, KS 66612  
Tel: (785) 368-8435  
Fax: (785) 291-3767  
jeff.chanay@ag.ks.gov  
bryan.clark@ag.ks.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Kansas*

Margaret Claiborne Campbell  
Angela J. Levin  
TROUTMAN SANDERS LLP  
600 Peachtree Street, N.E., Suite 5200  
Atlanta, GA 30308-2216  
Tel: (404) 885-3000  
margaret.campbell@troutmansanders.com  
angela.levin@troutmansanders.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Georgia Power Company*

Jeffrey A. Stone  
BEGGS & LANE, RLLP  
501 Commendencia Street  
Pensacola, FL 32502  
Tel: (850) 432-2451  
JAS@beggslane.com

James S. Alves  
2110 Trescott Drive  
Tallahassee, FL 32308  
Tel: (850) 566-7607  
jim.s.alves@outlook.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Gulf Power Company*

Andy Beshear  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF KENTUCKY  
Joseph A. Newberg II  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
700 Capital Avenue  
Suite 118  
Frankfort, KY 40601  
Tel: (502) 696-5611  
joe.newberg@ky.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner Commonwealth of Kentucky*

Jeff Landry  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF LOUISIANA  
Steven B. “Beaux” Jones  
*Counsel of Record*  
Environmental Section – Civil Division  
1885 N. Third Street  
Baton Rouge, LA 70804  
Tel: (225) 326-6085  
Fax: (225) 326-6099  
jonesst@ag.state.la.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Louisiana*

Terese T. Wyly  
Ben H. Stone  
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP  
1310 Twenty Fifth Avenue  
Gulfport, MS 39501-1931  
Tel: (228) 214-0413  
twyly@balch.com  
bstone@balch.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Mississippi Power  
Company*

Randy E. Brogdon  
TROUTMAN SANDERS LLP  
600 Peachtree Street, N.E., Suite 5200  
Atlanta, GA 30308-2216  
Tel: (404) 885-3000  
randy.brogdon@troutmansanders.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Southern Power Company*

Herman Robinson  
General Counsel  
Donald Trahan  
*Counsel of Record*  
Spencer Bowman  
Elliott Vega  
LOUISIANA DEPARTMENT OF  
ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY  
Legal Division  
P.O. Box 4302  
Baton Rouge, LA 70821-4302  
Tel: (225) 219-3985  
Fax: (225) 219-4068  
donald.trahan@la.gov  
spencer.bowman@la.gov  
elliott.vega@la.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Louisiana  
Department of Environmental Quality*

Bill Schuette  
ATTORNEY GENERAL FOR THE PEOPLE  
OF MICHIGAN  
Aaron D. Lindstrom  
Michigan Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Neil D. Gordon  
Assistant Attorney General  
P.O. Box 30212  
Lansing, MI 48909  
Tel: (515) 373-1124  
Fax: (517) 373-3042  
lindstroma@michigan.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner People of the State of  
Michigan*

David M. Flannery  
Kathy G. Beckett  
Edward L. Kropp  
STEPTOE & JOHNSON, PLLC  
707 Virginia Street East  
Charleston, WV 25326  
Tel: (304) 353-8000  
dave.flannery@steptoe-johnson.com  
kathy.beckett@steptoe-johnson.com  
skipp.kropp@steptoe-johnson.com

Stephen L. Miller  
STEPTOE & JOHNSON, PLLC  
700 N. Hurstbourne Parkway, Suite 115  
Louisville, KY 40222  
Tel: (502) 423-2000  
steve.miller@steptoe-johnson.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Indiana Utility Group*

Josh Hawley  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF MISSOURI  
D. John Sauer  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Laura Elsbury  
Assistant Attorney General  
P.O. Box 899  
207 W. High Street  
Jefferson City, MO 65102  
Tel: (573) 751-1800  
Fax: (573) 751-0774  
john.sauer@ago.mo.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Missouri*



P. Stephen Gidiere III  
Thomas L. Casey III  
Julia B. Barber  
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP  
1901 6th Avenue N., Suite 1500  
Birmingham, AL 35203  
Tel: (205) 251-8100  
sgidiere@balch.com

Stephanie Z. Moore  
Executive Vice President & General  
Counsel  
VISTRA ENERGY CORP.  
1601 Bryan Street, 22nd Floor  
Dallas, TX 75201

Daniel J. Kelly  
Vice President & Associate General  
Counsel  
VISTRA ENERGY CORP.  
1601 Bryan Street, 43rd Floor  
Dallas, TX 75201

*Counsel for Petitioners Luminant Generation  
Company LLC; Oak Grove Management  
Company LLC; Big Brown Power Company  
LLC; Sandow Power Company LLC; Big  
Brown Lignite Company LLC; Luminant  
Mining Company LLC; and Luminant Big  
Brown Mining Company LLC*

Timothy C. Fox  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF MONTANA  
Dale Schowengerdt  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
215 North Sanders  
Helena, MT 59620-1401  
Tel: (406) 444-7008  
dales@mt.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Montana*

Thomas A. Lorenzen  
CROWELL & MORING LLP  
1001 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 624-2500  
tlorenzen@crowell.com

*Counsel for Petitioners National Rural Electric  
Cooperative Association; Sunflower Electric  
Power Corporation; and Tri-State Generation  
and Transmission Association, Inc.*

*Of Counsel*

Rae Cronmiller  
Environmental Counsel  
NATIONAL RURAL ELECTRIC  
COOPERATIVE ASSOCIATION  
4301 Wilson Blvd.  
Arlington, VA 22203  
Tel: (703) 907-5500  
rae.cronmiller@nreca.coop

Douglas J. Peterson  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NEBRASKA  
Dave Bydlaek  
Chief Deputy Attorney General  
Justin D. Lavene  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
2115 State Capitol  
Lincoln, NE 68509  
Tel: (402) 471-2834  
justin.lavene@nebraska.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Nebraska*

Christina F. Gomez  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
555 Seventeenth Street, Suite 3200  
Denver, CO 80202  
Tel: (303) 295-8000  
Fax: (303) 295-8261  
cgomez@hollandhart.com

Patrick R. Day  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
2515 Warren Avenue, Suite 450  
Cheyenne, WY 82001  
Tel: (307) 778-4200  
Fax: (307) 778-8175  
pday@hollandhart.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Basin Electric Power  
Cooperative*

John M. Holloway III  
EVERSHEDS SUTHERLAND (US) LLP  
700 Sixth Street, N.W., Suite 700  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Tel: (202) 383-0100  
Fax: (202) 383-3593  
jayholloway@eversheds-  
sutherland.com

*Counsel for Petitioners East Kentucky Power  
Cooperative, Inc.; Hoosier Energy Rural Electric  
Cooperative, Inc.; and Minnesota Power  
Cooperative, Inc.*

Michael DeWine  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF OHIO  
Eric E. Murphy  
State Solicitor  
*Counsel of Record*  
30 E. Broad Street, 17th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Tel: (614) 466-8980  
eric.murphy@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Ohio*

Mike Hunter  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF OKLAHOMA  
P. Clayton Eubanks  
Deputy Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Oklahoma Office of the Attorney  
General  
313 N.E. 21st Street  
Oklahoma City, OK 73105  
Tel: (405) 522-8992  
Fax: (405) 522-0608  
clayton.eubanks@oag.ok.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Oklahoma*

Jeffrey R. Holmstead  
BRACEWELL LLP  
2001 M Street, N.W., Suite 900  
Washington, D.C. 20036  
Tel: (202) 828-5852  
Fax: (202) 857-4812  
jeff.holmstead@bracewelllaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioner American Coalition for  
Clean Coal Electricity*

Peter S. Glaser  
TROUTMAN SANDERS LLP  
401 Ninth Street N.W., Suite 1000  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 274-2998  
Fax: (202) 654-5611  
peter.glaser@troutmansanders.com

Carroll W. McGuffey III  
Justin T. Wong  
TROUTMAN SANDERS LLP  
600 Peachtree Street, N.E., Suite 5200  
Atlanta, GA 30308  
Tel: (404) 885-3000  
mack.mcguffey@troutmansanders.com  
justin.wong@troutmansanders.com

*Counsel for Petitioner National Mining  
Association*

Alan Wilson  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF SOUTH  
CAROLINA  
Robert D. Cook  
Solicitor General  
James Emory Smith, Jr.  
Deputy Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
P.O. Box 11549  
Columbia, SC 29211  
Tel: (803) 734-3680  
Fax: (803) 734-3677  
esmith@scag.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of South Carolina*

Marty J. Jackley  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF SOUTH  
DAKOTA  
Steven R. Blair  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
1302 E. Highway 14, Suite 1  
Pierre, SD 57501  
Tel: (605) 773-3215  
steven.blair@state.sd.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of South Dakota*

Chaim Mandelbaum  
Litigation Manager  
FREE MARKET ENVIRONMENTAL LAW  
CLINIC  
726 N. Nelson Street, Suite 9  
Arlington, VA 22203  
Tel: (703) 577-9973  
chaim12@gmail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Energy & Environment  
Legal Institute*

Peter D. Keisler  
C. Frederick Beckner III  
Ryan C. Morris  
SIDLEY AUSTIN, LLP  
1501 K Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Tel: (202) 736-8027  
pkeisler@sidley.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Chamber of Commerce of  
the United States of America; National  
Association of Manufacturers; American Fuel  
& Petrochemical Manufacturers; National  
Federation of Independent Business; American  
Chemistry Council; American Coke and Coal  
Chemicals Institute; American Forest & Paper  
Association; American Foundry Society;  
American Iron and Steel Institute; American  
Wood Council; Brick Industry Association;  
Electricity Consumers Resource Council;  
National Lime Association; National Oilseed  
Processors Association; and Portland Cement  
Association*

Ken Paxton  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
Jeffrey C. Mateer  
First Assistant Attorney General  
Scott A. Keller  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
P.O. Box 12548  
Austin, TX 78711-2548  
Tel: (512) 936-1700  
scott.keller@texasattorneygeneral.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Texas*

Sean Reyes  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF UTAH  
Tyler R. Green  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Parker Douglas  
Chief Federal Deputy  
Utah State Capitol Complex  
350 North State Street, Suite 230  
Salt Lake City, UT 84114-2320  
tylergreen@agutah.gov  
pdouglas@agutah.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Utah*

Steven P. Lehotsky  
Sheldon B. Gilbert  
U.S. CHAMBER LITIGATION CENTER, INC.  
1615 H Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20062  
Tel: (202) 463-5337  
slehotsky@uschamber.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Chamber of Commerce of  
the United States of America*

Linda E. Kelly  
Quentin Riegel  
Leland P. Frost  
MANUFACTURERS' CENTER FOR LEGAL  
ACTION  
733 10th Street, N.W., Suite 700  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Tel: (202) 637-3000  
qriegel@nam.org

*Counsel for Petitioner National Association of  
Manufacturers*

Brad D. Schimel  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WISCONSIN  
Misha Tseytlin  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Delanie M. Breuer  
Chief of Staff  
Wisconsin Department of Justice  
17 West Main Street  
Madison, WI 53707  
Tel: (608) 267-9323  
tseytlinm@doj.state.wi.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Wisconsin*

Peter K. Michael  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WYOMING  
James Kaste  
Deputy Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Erik Petersen  
Elizabeth Morrisseau  
Senior Assistant Attorneys General  
2320 Capitol Avenue  
Cheyenne, WY 82002  
Tel: (307) 777-6946  
Fax: (307) 777-3542  
james.kaste@wyo.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Wyoming*

Richard S. Moskowitz  
AMERICAN FUEL & PETROCHEMICAL  
MANUFACTURERS  
1667 K Street, N.W., Suite 700  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Tel: (202) 457-0480  
rmoskowitz@afpm.org

*Counsel for Petitioner American Fuel &  
Petrochemical Manufacturers*

Karen R. Harned  
Executive Director  
Elizabeth A. Milito  
Senior Executive Counsel  
NATIONAL FEDERATION OF  
INDEPENDENT BUSINESS  
SMALL BUSINESS LEGAL CENTER  
1201 F Street, N.W., Suite 200  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 314-2061  
karen.harned@nfib.org  
elizabeth.milito@nfib.org

*Counsel for Petitioner National Federation of  
Independent Business*

Mark Walters  
Michael J. Nasi  
JACKSON WALKER L.L.P.  
100 Congress Avenue, Suite 1100  
Austin, TX 78701  
Tel: (512) 236-2000  
Fax: (512) 236-2002  
mwalters@jw.com  
mnasi@jw.com

Douglas Bryan Hughes  
LAW OFFICES OF D. BRYAN HUGHES  
701 N. Pacific Street  
Mineola, TX 75773  
Tel: (903) 569-8880  
Fax: (903) 569-8889  
bryan@hughesfirm.com

*Counsel for Petitioner-Intervenors Lignite Energy  
Council and Gulf Coast Lignite Coalition*



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<b><u>Page</u></b>
TABLE OF CONTENTS .....	i
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES .....	ii
GLOSSARY OF TERMS .....	iv
SUPPLEMENTAL BRIEF .....	1
CONCLUSION .....	6

## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	<u>Page</u>
<b>Federal Cases</b>	
<i>Akiachak Native Cmty. v. U.S. Dep’t of the Interior</i> , 827 F.3d 100 (D.C. Cir. 2016) .....	3
<i>Am. Petroleum Inst. v. EPA</i> , 683 F.3d 382 (D.C. Cir. 2012) .....	2
<i>Am. Water Works Ass’n v. EPA</i> , 40 F.3d 1266 (D.C. Cir. 1994) .....	5
<i>Coal River Energy, LLC v. Jewell</i> , 751 F.3d 659 (D.C. Cir. 2014) .....	6
<i>Larsen v. U.S. Navy</i> , 525 F.3d 1 (D.C. Cir. 2008) .....	3
<i>Mississippi v. EPA</i> , 744 F.3d 1334 (D.C. Cir. 2013) .....	4
<i>Ohio v. U.S. Dep’t of the Interior</i> , 880 F.2d 432 (D.C. Cir. 1989) .....	5
<i>Sierra Club de Puerto Rico v. EPA</i> , 815 F.3d 22 (D.C. Cir. 2016) .....	6
<i>Time Warner Entm’t Co., L.P. v. United States</i> , 211 F.3d 1313 (D.C. Cir. 2000) .....	2
<i>U.S. Telecom Ass’n v. FCC</i> , No. 15-1063 (and consolidated cases), 2017 WL 1541517 (D.C. Cir. May 1, 2017) .....	2
<b>Statute</b>	
42 U.S.C. § 7607(b)(1) .....	6
<b>Rule</b>	
D.C. Cir. R. 41(b) .....	5
<b>Regulations</b>	
75 Fed. Reg. 2,938 (Jan. 19, 2010) .....	4

82 Fed. Reg. 16,093 (Mar. 31, 2017) .....	3
82 Fed. Reg. 16,329 (Apr. 4, 2017) .....	3

## Other Authorities

Letter from Lisa P. Jackson, Adm'r, EPA, to Sen. Thomas R. Carper at 2 (July 13, 2011) (attached as Ex. B) .....	4
Order, <i>California v. EPA</i> , No. 08-1178 (and consolidated cases) (D.C. Cir. Feb. 25, 2009), ECF No. 1167136 .....	2
Order, <i>California v. EPA</i> , No. 08-1178 (and consolidated cases) (D.C. Cir. Sept. 3, 2009), ECF No. 1204414 .....	2
Order, <i>Dalton Trucking, Inc. v. EPA</i> , No. 13-74019 (9th Cir. May 10, 2017), ECF No. 10428699 .....	1
Order, <i>Mississippi v. EPA</i> , No. 08-1200 (and consolidated cases) (D.C. Cir. Jan. 21, 2010), ECF No. 1226738 .....	4
Order, <i>Mississippi v. EPA</i> , No. 08-1200 (and consolidated cases) (D.C. Cir. Mar. 19, 2009), ECF No. 1171013. ....	4
Order, <i>Murray Energy Corp. v. EPA</i> , No. 15-1385 (and consolidated cases) (D.C. Cir. Apr. 11, 2017), ECF No. 1670626 .....	1
Order, <i>Murray Energy Corp. v. EPA</i> , No. 16-1127 (and consolidated cases) (D.C. Cir. Apr. 27, 2017), ECF No. 1672987 .....	1
Order, <i>Walter Coke, Inc. v. EPA</i> , No. 15-1166 (and consolidated cases) (D.C. Cir. Apr. 24, 2017), ECF No. 1672430 .....	1
Robin Bravender, <i>Tighter smog regs expected as EPA studies Bush rule</i> , E&E NEWS PM (Sept. 16, 2009) (attached as Ex. A) .....	4

## **GLOSSARY OF TERMS**

EPA	United States Environmental Protection Agency
Rule	U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Standards of Performance for Greenhouse Gas Emissions From New, Modified, and Reconstructed Stationary Sources: Electric Utility Generating Units, Final Rule, 80 Fed. Reg. 64,510 (Oct. 23, 2015)

Petitioners and Petitioner-Intervenors respectfully submit this supplemental brief pursuant to this Court's Order of April 28, 2017, directing the parties to address whether these cases should be remanded to the Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA") rather than held in abeyance. ECF No. 1673072. For two reasons, this Court should hold these cases in abeyance pending EPA's review of the Rule.

*First*, there is no basis to distinguish these cases from those that this Court has held in abeyance within the last month pending EPA regulatory review. Several of those cases had also been fully briefed and scheduled for oral argument. *See* Order, *Walter Coke, Inc. v. EPA*, No. 15-1166 (and consolidated cases) (D.C. Cir. Apr. 24, 2017), ECF No. 1672430 (oral argument previously scheduled for May 8, 2017); Order, *Murray Energy Corp. v. EPA*, No. 15-1385 (and consolidated cases) (D.C. Cir. Apr. 11, 2017), ECF No. 1670626 (oral argument previously scheduled for April 19, 2017); Order, *Murray Energy Corp. v. EPA*, No. 16-1127 (and consolidated cases) (D.C. Cir. Apr. 27, 2017), ECF No. 1672987 (oral argument previously scheduled for May 18, 2017); *see also* Order, *Dalton Trucking, Inc. v. EPA*, No. 13-74019 (9th Cir. May 10, 2017), ECF No. 10428699 (oral argument previously scheduled for May 18, 2017).<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Respondent-Intervenors have argued in *West Virginia v. EPA*, No. 15-1363 (D.C. Cir.) (and consolidated cases), that the Supreme Court's stay of the rule at issue in that case distinguishes it from other cases with respect to abeyance. That argument lacks merit, as Petitioners and Petitioner-Intervenors in that case explain in the supplemental brief filed in that proceeding today. Regardless of the merits of that argument, the Rule at issue in this proceeding has not been stayed.

As in those instances, these cases should be held in abeyance consistent with this Court's longstanding practice in a wide variety of procedural circumstances. For example, in 2009, this Court held in abeyance the State of California's challenge to EPA's denial of a waiver for new motor vehicle emission standards, *see* Order, *California v. EPA*, No. 08-1178 (and consolidated cases) (D.C. Cir. Feb. 25, 2009), ECF No. 1167136, which the agency later rescinded and reversed, *see* Order, *California v. EPA*, No. 08-1178 (and consolidated cases) (D.C. Cir. Sept. 3, 2009), ECF No. 1204414 (dismissing the petitions for review as moot). This Court has also granted abeyance based on the agency's intention to revisit a rule after merits briefing had concluded. *Am. Petroleum Inst. v. EPA*, 683 F.3d 382, 384 (D.C. Cir. 2012). And this Court has held in abeyance petitions for review of the Federal Communications Commission's rules pending reconsideration by the Commission. *Time Warner Entm't Co., L.P. v. United States*, 211 F.3d 1313, 1316 (D.C. Cir. 2000).

The reasons for this established practice are well known. As this Court has explained and appears to have recognized in its Order, it makes little sense to actively proceed with judicial review when an agency has embarked on a review that could ultimately lead to a substantial revision or rescission of the rule. *See Am. Petroleum Inst. v. EPA*, 683 F.3d at 388 (holding a case in abeyance where a new proposal "would likely moot the analysis [the court] could undertake" in deciding the case); *see also U.S. Telecom Ass'n v. FCC*, No. 15-1063 (and consolidated cases), 2017 WL 1541517, at \*1 (D.C. Cir. May 1, 2017) (Srinivasan & Tatel, JJ., concurring in the denial of rehearing

en banc) (noting that “en banc review would be particularly unwarranted” where the agency “will soon consider adopting a Notice of Proposed Rulemaking that would replace the existing rule with a markedly different one”). Abeyance conserves judicial and party resources, and allows the Court to efficiently dispose of petitions for review if the challenges become moot. *See Akiachak Native Cmty. v. U.S. Dep’t of the Interior*, 827 F.3d 100, 106 (D.C. Cir. 2016) (when a petition challenges a “regulation [that] no longer exists, [the Court] can do nothing to affect [petitioners’] rights relative to it, thus making th[e] case classically moot”); *Larsen v. U.S. Navy*, 525 F.3d 1, 4-5 (D.C. Cir. 2008) (concluding challenge to a withdrawn policy was moot).

*Second*, holding these cases in abeyance best protects Petitioners’ rights to judicial review and this Court’s ability to resolve challenges to the Rule should EPA ultimately not revise or rescind the Rule. As EPA has noted, the President has directed the agency to review the Rule, *see* Exec. Order No. 13,783, “Promoting Energy Independence and Economic Growth,” § 4, 82 Fed. Reg. 16,093, 16,095 (Mar. 31, 2017), and EPA has commenced that review, *see* Notice of Executive Order, EPA Review of Clean Power Plan and Forthcoming Rulemaking, and Motion to Hold Case in Abeyance (Mar. 28, 2017), ECF No. 1668276; 82 Fed. Reg. 16,329 (Apr. 4, 2017). But as shown in a prior analogous situation described below, such a review may not necessarily result in any change to the Rule even if that outcome is widely anticipated, and abeyance clearly preserves both Petitioners’ rights and this Court’s responsibility to consider the legality of the Rule.

In 2009, the then-new presidential administration sought and received from this Court abeyance of a pending legal challenge while EPA reviewed a National Ambient Air Quality Standard for ozone that had been adopted the previous year. *See* Order, *Mississippi v. EPA*, No. 08-1200 (and consolidated cases) (D.C. Cir. Jan. 21, 2010), ECF No. 1226738; Order, *Mississippi v. EPA*, No. 08-1200 (and consolidated cases) (D.C. Cir. Mar. 19, 2009), ECF No. 1171013. The standard had been criticized, and it was believed that EPA would reset the standard at a lower level. *See, e.g.*, Robin Bravender, *Tighter smog regs expected as EPA studies Bush rule*, E&E NEWS PM (Sept. 16, 2009) (attached as Ex. A). Indeed, claiming that the standard was “not legally defensible,” EPA formally proposed to tighten the standard. Letter from Lisa P. Jackson, Adm’r, EPA, to Sen. Thomas R. Carper at 2 (July 13, 2011) (attached as Ex. B); 75 Fed. Reg. 2,938 (Jan. 19, 2010). In the end, however, EPA decided not to revise the standard but instead to leave the rule in place unchanged, and this Court proceeded simply to lift the abeyance and decide the merits of the legal challenge. *Mississippi v. EPA*, 744 F.3d 1334, 1341 (D.C. Cir. 2013) (per curiam).

This example illustrates the benefits of abeyance in these cases. By holding these cases in abeyance, this Court retains jurisdiction over the pending petitions for review. And if EPA ultimately does not decide to revise or rescind the Rule, this Court can lift that abeyance, reactivate these cases, and proceed directly to resolving the merits of the legal challenges to the Rule.



By contrast, the possible remand suggested by this Court raises questions about continued judicial review if EPA does not revise or rescind the Rule. D.C. Circuit Rules provide that if this Court remands “the record” in a case to the agency, the Court “retains jurisdiction over the case.” D.C. Cir. R. 41(b). But if the Court remands “the case,” the Court “does not retain jurisdiction, and a new notice of appeal or petition for review will be necessary if a party seeks review of the proceedings conducted on remand.” *Id.* This Court’s Order suggests that it is considering the latter form of remand, asking whether “the[] consolidated cases” should be remanded. Order, ECF No. 1673072.<sup>2</sup>

If this Court remands the consolidated cases without vacating the Rule and without retaining jurisdiction, and if EPA ultimately keeps the Rule in place, Petitioners could face arguments that this Court lacks jurisdiction to review the Rule. Under the Clean Air Act, a petition for review “shall be filed within sixty days from the date notice of such promulgation, approval, or action appears in the Federal Register, except that if such petition is based solely on grounds arising after such

---

<sup>2</sup> Moreover, this Court generally remands the record to allow the agency to provide reasons for its decision or clarify the record. *See, e.g., Am. Water Works Ass’n v. EPA*, 40 F.3d 1266, 1273 (D.C. Cir. 1994) (remanding the record for the agency to explain its basis for its decision to exclude transient, non-community waters systems from its regulation); *Ohio v. U.S. Dep’t of the Interior*, 880 F.2d 432, 461 (D.C. Cir. 1989) (“remand[ing] the record to the agency for clarification of its interpretation of its own regulations”). The remand this Court appears to contemplate is for the different and broader purpose of allowing EPA to review and possibly rescind the challenged rule itself.

sixtieth day, then any petition for review under this subsection shall be filed within sixty days after such grounds arise.” 42 U.S.C. § 7607(b)(1). The initial 60-day period would have long ago expired, and the exception for cases filed on after-arising grounds has been narrowly interpreted by this Court.<sup>3</sup> As a result, even though Petitioners timely filed their petitions for review in these cases, these statutory limitations could be used in an attempt to shield the Rule from any judicial review if, after a remand by this Court, EPA were ultimately not to change course.

While Petitioners do not concede that their timely-exercised rights to judicial review can be extinguished in this way, and believe that review would be available, these questions would be avoided by abeyance.

## CONCLUSION

This Court should hold the consolidated cases in abeyance.

---

<sup>3</sup> See, e.g., *Sierra Club de Puerto Rico v. EPA*, 815 F.3d 22, 27 (D.C. Cir. 2016) (rejecting argument that “‘the mere application of a regulation,’ without anything more, constitutes after-arising grounds”); see also *Coal River Energy, LLC v. Jewell*, 751 F.3d 659, 662-63 (D.C. Cir. 2014) (rejecting argument, in construing similar provision under Surface Mining Control and Reclamation Act, that emergence of parties not previously in existence constitutes after-arising grounds).

Dated: May 15, 2017

/s/ Allison D. Wood

F. William Brownell  
Allison D. Wood  
Henry V. Nickel  
Tauna M. Szymanski  
Andrew D. Knudsen  
HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
Tel: (202) 955-1500  
Fax: (202) 778-2201  
bbrownell@hunton.com  
awood@hunton.com  
hnickel@hunton.com  
tszymanski@hunton.com  
aknudsen@hunton.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Utility Air Regulatory  
Group and American Public Power Association*

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Elbert Lin

Patrick Morrissey  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WEST  
VIRGINIA  
Elbert Lin  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Thomas M. Johnson, Jr.  
Deputy Solicitor General  
Katlyn M. Miller  
Assistant Attorney General  
State Capitol Building 1, Room 26-E  
Charleston, WV 25305  
Tel: (304) 558-2021  
Fax: (304) 558-0140  
elbert.lin@wvago.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of West Virginia*

/s/ Geoffrey K. Barnes

Geoffrey K. Barnes  
Wendlene M. Lavey  
John D. Lazzaretti  
Robert D. Cheren  
SQUIRE PATTON BOGGS (US) LLP  
4900 Key Tower  
127 Public Square  
Cleveland, OH 44114  
Tel: (216) 479-8646  
geoffrey.barnes@squirepb.com  
wendy.lavey@squirepb.com  
john.lazzaretti@squirepb.com  
bobby.cheren@squirepb.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Murray Energy  
Corporation*

/s/ Paul M. Seby

Wayne Stenehjem  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NORTH  
DAKOTA  
Margaret Olson  
Assistant Attorney General  
North Dakota Attorney General's Office  
600 E. Boulevard Avenue #125  
Bismarck, ND 58505  
Tel: (701) 328-3640  
wstenehjem@nd.gov  
maiolson@nd.gov

Paul M. Seby  
Jerry Stouck  
Special Assistant Attorneys General  
State of North Dakota  
GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP  
1200 17th Street, Suite 2400  
Denver, CO 80202  
Tel: (303) 572-6500  
Fax: (303) 572-6540  
sebyp@gtlaw.com  
stouckj@gtlaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioner State of North Dakota*

/s/ Tristan L. Duncan

Tristan L. Duncan  
Thomas J. Grever  
SHOOK HARDY & BACON L.L.P.  
2555 Grand Boulevard  
Kansas City, MO 64018  
Tel: (816) 474-6550  
Fax: (816) 421-5547  
tlduncan@shb.com  
tgrever@shb.com@shb.com

Jonathan S. Massey  
MASSEY & GAIL, LLP  
1325 G Street, N.W., Suite 500  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Tel: (202) 652-4511  
Fax: (312) 379-0467  
jmassey@masseygail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Peabody Energy  
Corporation*

/s/ Eugene M. Trisko

Eugene M. Trisko  
LAW OFFICES OF EUGENE M. TRISKO  
P.O. Box 596  
Berkeley Springs, WV 25411  
Tel: (304) 258-1977  
Tel: (301) 639-5238 (cell)  
emtrisko7@gmail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner International Brotherhood  
of Boilermakers, Iron Ship Builders,  
Blacksmiths, Forgers & Helpers, AFL-CIO*

/s/ Dominic E. Draye

Mark Brnovich  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ARIZONA  
Dominic E. Draye  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Keith J. Miller  
Assistant Solicitor General  
Maureen Scott  
Janet Wagner  
Arizona Corporation Commission,  
Staff Attorneys  
1275 West Washington Street  
Phoenix, AZ 85007-2997  
Tel: (602) 542-3333  
Fax: (602) 542-8308  
dominic.draye@azag.gov  
keith.miller@azag.gov  
SolicitorGeneral@azag.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner Arizona Corporation  
Commission*

/s/ Lee Rudofsky

Leslie Rutledge  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ARKANSAS  
Lee Rudofsky  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Nicholas J. Bronni  
Deputy Solicitor General  
Jamie L. Ewing  
Assistant Attorney General  
323 Center Street, Suite 400  
Little Rock, AR 72201  
Tel: (501) 682-5310  
lee.rudofsky@arkansasag.gov  
jamie.ewing@arkansasag.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Arkansas*

/s/ Grant F. Crandall

Grant F. Crandall  
General Counsel  
UNITED MINE WORKERS OF AMERICA  
18354 Quantico Gateway Drive  
Triangle, VA 22172  
Tel: (703) 291-2429  
gcrandall@umwa.org

Arthur Traynor, III  
Staff Counsel  
UNITED MINE WORKERS OF AMERICA  
18354 Quantico Gateway Drive  
Triangle, VA 22172  
Tel: (703) 291-2457  
atraynor@umwa.org

Eugene M. Trisko  
LAW OFFICES OF EUGENE M. TRISKO  
P.O. Box 596  
Berkeley Springs, WV 25411  
Tel: (304) 258-1977  
emtrisko7@gmail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner United Mine Workers of  
America, AFL-CIO*

/s/ Jonathan L. Williams

Pamela Jo Bondi  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF FLORIDA  
Jonathan L. Williams  
Deputy Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Jonathan A. Glogau  
Special Counsel  
Office of the Attorney General  
PL-01, The Capitol  
Tallahassee, FL 32399-1050  
Tel: (850) 414-3818  
Fax: (850) 410-2672  
jonathan.williams@myfloridalegal.com  
jonathan.glogau@myfloridalegal.com

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Florida*

/s/ Stacey Turner

Stacey Turner  
SOUTHERN COMPANY SERVICES, INC.  
600 18th Street North  
BIN 14N-8195  
Birmingham, AL 35203  
Tel: (205) 257-2923  
staturner@southernco.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Alabama Power  
Company, Georgia Power Company, Gulf Power  
Company, Mississippi Power Company, and  
Southern Power Company*

/s/ C. Grady Moore III

C. Grady Moore III  
Steven G. McKinney  
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP  
1901 Sixth Avenue North, Suite 1500  
Birmingham, AL 35303-4642  
Tel: (205) 251-8100  
Fax: (205) 488-5704  
gmoore@balch.com  
smckinney@balch.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Alabama Power Company*

/s/ Sarah Hawkins Warren

Christopher M. Carr  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF GEORGIA  
Sarah Hawkins Warren  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Office of the Attorney General  
40 Capitol Square S.W.  
Atlanta, GA 30334-1300  
Tel: (404) 463-0070  
Fax: (404) 657-8773  
swarren@law.ga.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Georgia*

/s/ Thomas M. Fisher

Curtis T. Hill, Jr.  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF INDIANA  
Thomas M. Fisher  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Office of the Attorney General  
Indiana Government Ctr. South  
Fifth Floor  
302 West Washington Street  
Indianapolis, IN 46204-2770  
Tel: (317) 232-6255  
Fax: (317) 232-7979  
tom.fisher@atg.in.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Indiana*

/s/ Margaret Claiborne Campbell  
Margaret Claiborne Campbell  
Angela J. Levin  
TROUTMAN SANDERS LLP  
600 Peachtree Street, NE, Suite 5200  
Atlanta, GA 30308-2216  
Tel: (404) 885-3000  
margaret.campbell@troutmansanders.com  
angela.levin@troutmansanders.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Georgia Power Company*

/s/ Jeffrey A. Stone  
Jeffrey A. Stone  
BEGGS & LANE, RLLP  
501 Commendancia Street  
Pensacola, FL 32502  
Tel: (850) 432-2451  
JAS@beggslane.com

James S. Alves  
2110 Trescott Drive  
Tallahassee, FL 32308  
Tel: (850) 566-7607  
jim.s.alves@outlook.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Gulf Power Company*

/s/ Jeffrey A. Chanay  
Derek Schmidt  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF KANSAS  
Jeffrey A. Chanay  
Chief Deputy Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Bryan C. Clark  
Assistant Solicitor General  
120 S.W. 10th Avenue, 3rd Floor  
Topeka, KS 66612  
Tel: (785) 368-8435  
Fax: (785) 291-3767  
jeff.chanay@ag.ks.gov  
bryan.clark@ag.ks.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Kansas*

/s/ Joseph A. Newberg II  
Andy Beshear  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF KENTUCKY  
Joseph A. Newberg II  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
700 Capital Avenue  
Suite 118  
Frankfort, KY 40601  
Tel: (502) 696-5611  
joe.newberg@ky.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner Commonwealth of Kentucky*



/s/ Terese T. Wyly

Terese T. Wyly

Ben H. Stone

BALCH & BINGHAM LLP

1310 Twenty Fifth Avenue

Gulfport, MS 39501-1931

Tel: (228) 214-0413

twyly@balch.com

bstone@balch.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Mississippi Power  
Company*

/s/ Randy E. Brogdon

Randy E. Brogdon

TROUTMAN SANDERS LLP

600 Peachtree Street, N.E., Suite 5200

Atlanta, GA 30308-2216

Tel: (404) 885-3000

randy.brogdon@troutmansanders.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Southern Power Company*

/s/ Steven B. "Beaux" Jones

Jeff Landry

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF LOUISIANA

Steven B. "Beaux" Jones

*Counsel of Record*

Environmental Section – Civil Division

1885 N. Third Street

Baton Rouge, LA 70804

Tel: (225) 326-6085

Fax: (225) 326-6099

jonesst@ag.state.la.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Louisiana*

/s/ Donald Trahan

Herman Robinson

Executive Counsel

Donald Trahan

*Counsel of Record*

Spencer Bowman

Elliott Vega

LOUISIANA DEPARTMENT OF

ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

Legal Division

P.O. Box 4302

Baton Rouge, LA 70821-4302

Tel: (225) 219-3985

Fax: (225) 219-4068

donald.trahan@la.gov

spencer.bowman@la.gov

elliott.vega@la.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Louisiana  
Department of Environmental Quality*

/s/ David M. Flannery

David M. Flannery

Kathy G. Beckett

Edward L. Kropp

STEPTOE & JOHNSON, PLLC

707 Virginia Street East

Charleston, WV 25326

Tel: (304) 353-8000

dave.flannery@steptoe-johnson.com

kathy.beckett@steptoe-johnson.com

skipp.kropp@steptoe-johnson.com

Stephen L. Miller

STEPTOE & JOHNSON, PLLC

700 N. Hurstbourne Parkway, Suite 115

Louisville, KY 40222

Tel: (502) 423-2000

steve.miller@steptoe-johnson.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Indiana Utility Group*

/s/ Aaron D. Lindstrom

Bill Schuette

ATTORNEY GENERAL FOR THE PEOPLE

OF MICHIGAN

Aaron D. Lindstrom

Michigan Solicitor General

*Counsel of Record*

Neil D. Gordon

Assistant Attorney General

P.O. Box 30212

Lansing, MI 48909

Tel: (515) 373-1124

Fax: (517) 373-3042

lindstroma@michigan.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner People of the State of  
Michigan*

/s/ P. Stephen Gidiere III

P. Stephen Gidiere III  
Thomas L. Casey III  
Julia B. Barber  
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP  
1901 6th Avenue N., Suite 1500  
Birmingham, AL 35203  
Tel: (205) 251-8100  
sgidiere@balch.com

Stephanie Z. Moore  
Executive Vice President & General  
Counsel  
VISTRA ENERGY CORP.  
1601 Bryan Street, 22nd Floor  
Dallas, TX 75201

Daniel J. Kelly  
Vice President & Associate General  
Counsel  
VISTRA ENERGY CORP.  
1601 Bryan Street, 43rd Floor  
Dallas, TX 75201

*Counsel for Petitioners Luminant Generation  
Company LLC; Oak Grove Management  
Company LLC; Big Brown Power Company  
LLC; Sandow Power Company LLC; Big  
Brown Lignite Company LLC; Luminant  
Mining Company LLC; and Luminant Big  
Brown Mining Company LLC*

/s/ D. John Sauer

Josh Hawley  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF MISSOURI  
D. John Sauer  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Laura Elsbury  
Assistant Attorney General  
P.O. Box 899  
207 W. High Street  
Jefferson City, MO 65102  
Tel: (573) 751-1800  
Fax: (573) 751-0774  
john.sauer@ago.mo.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Missouri*

/s/ Thomas A. Lorenzen

Thomas A. Lorenzen  
CROWELL & MORING LLP  
1001 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 624-2500  
tlorenzen@crowell.com

*Counsel for Petitioners National Rural Electric  
Cooperative Association; Sunflower Electric  
Power Corporation; and Tri-State Generation  
and Transmission Association, Inc.*

*Of Counsel*

Rae Cronmiller  
Environmental Counsel  
NATIONAL RURAL ELECTRIC  
COOPERATIVE ASSOCIATION  
4301 Wilson Blvd.  
Arlington, VA 22203  
Tel: (703) 907-5500  
rae.cronmiller@nreca.coop

/s/ Dale Schowengerdt

Timothy C. Fox  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF MONTANA  
Dale Schowengerdt  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
215 North Sanders  
Helena, MT 59620-1401  
Tel: (406) 444-7008  
dales@mt.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Montana*

/s/ Christina F. Gomez

Christina F. Gomez  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
555 Seventeenth Street, Suite 3200  
Denver, CO 80202  
Tel: (303) 295-8000  
Fax: (303) 295-8261  
cgomez@hollandhart.com

Patrick R. Day  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
2515 Warren Avenue, Suite 450  
Cheyenne, WY 82001  
Tel: (307) 778-4200  
Fax: (307) 778-8175  
pday@hollandhart.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Basin Electric Power  
Cooperative*

/s/ John M. Holloway III

John M. Holloway III  
EVERSHEDS SUTHERLAND (US) LLP  
700 Sixth Street, N.W., Suite 700  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Tel: (202) 383-0100  
Fax: (202) 383-3593  
jayholloway@eversheds-  
sutherland.com

*Counsel for Petitioners East Kentucky Power  
Cooperative, Inc.; Hoosier Energy Rural Electric  
Cooperative, Inc.; and Minnkota Power  
Cooperative, Inc.*

/s/ Justin D. Lavene

Douglas J. Peterson  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NEBRASKA  
Dave Bydlaek  
Chief Deputy Attorney General  
Justin D. Lavene  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
2115 State Capitol  
Lincoln, NE 68509  
Tel: (402) 471-2834  
justin.lavene@nebraska.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Nebraska*

/s/ Jeffrey R. Holmstead

Jeffrey R. Holmstead

BRACEWELL LLP

2001 M Street, N.W., Suite 900

Washington, D.C. 20036

Tel: (202) 828-5852

Fax: (202) 857-4812

jeff.holmstead@bracewelllaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioner American Coalition for  
Clean Coal Electricity*

/s/ Eric E. Murphy

Michael DeWine

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF OHIO

Eric E. Murphy

State Solicitor

*Counsel of Record*

30 E. Broad Street, 17th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

Tel: (614) 466-8980

eric.murphy@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Ohio*

/s/ Peter S. Glaser

Peter S. Glaser  
TROUTMAN SANDERS LLP  
401 Ninth Street N.W., Suite 1000  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 274-2998  
Fax: (202) 654-5611  
peter.glaser@troutmansanders.com

Carroll W. McGuffey III  
Justin T. Wong  
TROUTMAN SANDERS LLP  
600 Peachtree Street, N.E., Suite 5200  
Atlanta, GA 30308  
Tel: (404) 885-3000  
mack.mcguiffey@troutmansanders.com  
justin.wong@troutmansanders.com

*Counsel for Petitioner National Mining  
Association*

/s/ Chaim Mandelbaum

Chaim Mandelbaum  
Litigation Manager  
FREE MARKET ENVIRONMENTAL LAW  
CLINIC  
726 N. Nelson Street, Suite 9  
Arlington, VA 22203  
Tel: (703) 577-9973  
chaim12@gmail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Energy & Environment  
Legal Institute*

/s/ P. Clayton Eubanks

Mike Hunter  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF OKLAHOMA  
P. Clayton Eubanks  
Deputy Solicitor General  
Oklahoma Office of the Attorney  
General  
313 N.E. 21st Street  
Oklahoma City, OK 73105  
Tel: (405) 522-8992  
Fax: (405) 522-0608  
clayton.eubanks@oag.ok.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Oklahoma*

/s/ James Emory Smith, Jr.

Alan Wilson  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF SOUTH  
CAROLINA  
Robert D. Cook  
Solicitor General  
James Emory Smith, Jr.  
Deputy Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
P.O. Box 11549  
Columbia, SC 29211  
Tel: (803) 734-3680  
Fax: (803) 734-3677  
esmith@scag.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of South Carolina*

/s/ Peter D. Keisler

Peter D. Keisler  
C. Frederick Beckner III  
Ryan C. Morris  
SIDLEY AUSTIN, LLP  
1501 K Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Tel: (202) 736-8027  
pkeisler@sidley.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Chamber of Commerce of the United States of America; National Association of Manufacturers; American Fuel & Petrochemical Manufacturers; National Federation of Independent Business; American Chemistry Council; American Coke and Coal Chemicals Institute; American Forest & Paper Association; American Foundry Society; American Iron & Steel Institute; American Wood Council; Brick Industry Association; Electricity Consumers Resource Council; National Lime Association; National Oilseed Processors Association; and Portland Cement Association*

/s/ Steven P. Lehotsky

Steven P. Lehotsky  
Sheldon B. Gilbert  
U.S. CHAMBER LITIGATION CENTER, INC.  
1615 H Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20062  
Tel: (202) 463-5337  
slehotsky@uschamber.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Chamber of Commerce of the United States of America*

/s/ Steven R. Blair

Marty J. Jackley  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF SOUTH  
DAKOTA  
Steven R. Blair  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
1302 E. Highway 14, Suite 1  
Pierre, SD 57501  
Tel: (605) 773-3215  
steven.blair@state.sd.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of South Dakota*

/s/ Scott A. Keller

Ken Paxton  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
Jeffrey C. Mateer  
First Assistant Attorney General  
Scott A. Keller  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
P.O. Box 12548  
Austin, TX 78711-2548  
Tel: (512) 936-1700  
scott.keller@texasattorneygeneral.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Texas*



/s/ Quentin Riegel

Linda E. Kelly  
Quentin Riegel  
Leland P. Frost  
MANUFACTURERS' CENTER FOR LEGAL  
ACTION  
733 10th Street, N.W., Suite 700  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Tel: (202) 637-3000  
qriegel@nam.org

*Counsel for Petitioner National Association of  
Manufacturers*

/s/ Richard S. Moskowitz

Richard S. Moskowitz  
AMERICAN FUEL & PETROCHEMICAL  
MANUFACTURERS  
1667 K Street, N.W., Suite 700  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Tel: (202) 457-0480  
rmoskowitz@afpm.org

*Counsel for Petitioner American Fuel &  
Petrochemical Manufacturers*

/s/ Tyler R. Green

Sean Reyes  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF UTAH  
Tyler R. Green  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Parker Douglas  
Chief Federal Deputy  
Utah State Capitol Complex  
350 North State Street, Suite 230  
Salt Lake City, UT 84114-2320  
tylergreen@utah.gov  
pdouglas@utah.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Utah*

/s/ Misha Tseytlin

Brad D. Schimel  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WISCONSIN  
Misha Tseytlin  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Delanie M. Breuer  
Chief of Staff  
Wisconsin Department of Justice  
17 West Main Street  
Madison, WI 53707  
Tel: (608) 267-9323  
tseytlinm@doj.state.wi.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Wisconsin*

/s/ Karen R. Harned

Karen R. Harned  
Executive Director  
Elizabeth A. Mito  
Senior Executive Counsel  
NATIONAL FEDERATION OF  
INDEPENDENT BUSINESS  
SMALL BUSINESS LEGAL CENTER  
1201 F Street, N.W., Suite 200  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 314-2061  
karen.harned@nfib.org  
elizabeth.mito@nfib.org

*Counsel for Petitioner National Federation of  
Independent Business*

/s/ Mark Walters

Mark Walters  
Michael J. Nasi  
JACKSON WALKER L.L.P.  
100 Congress Avenue, Suite 1100  
Austin, TX 78701  
Tel: (512) 236-2000  
Fax: (512) 236-2002  
mwalters@jw.com  
mnasi@jw.com

Douglas Bryan Hughes  
LAW OFFICES OF D. BRYAN HUGHES  
701 N. Pacific Street  
Mineola, TX 75773  
Tel: (903) 569-8880  
Fax: (903) 569-8889  
bryan@hughesfirm.com

*Counsel for Petitioner-Intervenors Lignite Energy  
Council and Gulf Coast Lignite Coalition*

/s/ James Kaste

Peter K. Michael  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WYOMING  
James Kaste  
Deputy Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Erik Petersen  
Elizabeth Morrisseau  
Senior Assistant Attorneys General  
2320 Capitol Avenue  
Cheyenne, WY 82002  
Tel: (307) 777-6946  
Fax: (307) 777-3542  
james.kaste@wyo.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Wyoming*

**CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE**

Pursuant to Rule 32(g) of the Federal Rules of Appellate Procedure and Circuit Rule 32(e)(2)(C), I hereby certify that the foregoing Supplemental Brief of Petitioners and Petitioner-Intervenors contains 1,626 words, as counted by a word processing system that includes headings, footnotes, quotations, and citations in the count, excluding the parts of the document exempted by Rule 32(f) of the Federal Rules of Appellate Procedure, and that this supplemental brief therefore is within the word limit of 3,900 words established by the Court in its Order of April 28, 2017. I also certify that this supplemental brief complies with the typeface and type-style requirements of Rule 32(a)(5) and (6) of the Federal Rules of Appellate Procedure because it has been prepared in a proportionally spaced typeface using Microsoft Word 2010 with 14-point Garamond font.

Dated: May 15, 2017

/s/ Elbert Lin  
Elbert Lin

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that, on this 15th day of May, 2017, a copy of the foregoing Supplemental Brief of Petitioners and Petitioner-Intervenors was served electronically through the Court's CM/ECF system on all ECF-registered counsel.

/s/ Elbert Lin  
Elbert Lin

# Exhibit A

[<< Back to E&E News PM index page.](#)

## AIR POLLUTION

### Tighter smog regs expected as EPA studies Bush rule

Robin Bravender, E&E reporter

Published: Wednesday, September 16, 2009

The Obama administration is expected to issue substantially tougher smog standards after reconsidering the contentious 2008 regulations set by the George W. Bush administration, clean air experts say.

In response to a court deadline, U.S. EPA announced today that it will reconsider the national air quality standards for ozone, or smog. The Bush EPA tightened the national limits last year, but critics assailed the administration for adopting a standard that failed to protect public health ([Greenwire](#), Sept. 16).

EPA said it plans to conduct a full review of the science that influenced the 2008 decision -- including more than 1,700 scientific studies and public comments that were submitted during that process. The agency said it would also review the findings of EPA's independent science advisory committee, which recommended stricter limits than those ultimately adopted.

"This is one of the most important protection measures we can take to safeguard our health and our environment," said EPA Administrator Lisa Jackson. "Reconsidering these standards and ensuring acceptable levels of ground-level ozone could cut health care costs and make our cities healthier, safer places to live, work and play."

Experts tracking the issue say the reconsideration will almost certainly lead to stricter standards.

"It is unimaginable that EPA would go through this whole process to come up with a standard that weakens the status quo," said Bill Becker, executive director of the National Association of Clean Air Agencies.

The Bush EPA strengthened the ozone limits from 84 parts per billion (ppb) to 75 ppb, although EPA's Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC) had recommended a primary health-based standard between 60 and 70 ppb.

Environmentalists also accused the Bush White House of interfering to prevent EPA from establishing a more stringent secondary standard to protect forests, crops and wildlife, something EPA staff members and science advisers had recommended.

"We all knew that [the Obama administration] wanted to reconsider it, but now the question is, what do they do?" said Jeff Holmstead, former EPA air chief during the Bush administration. "Most of us that watch these things think they'll probably end up lowering it to 70 or 69 or something."

Becker and Earthjustice attorney David Baron, who represented environmental groups in a lawsuit challenging the Bush standard, predicted that EPA will set the limit in its science advisers' recommended range of between 60 and 70 ppb.

"It's most likely to be somewhere within the range recommended by CASAC," Baron said. "Where that will be is an open question right now."

Despite EPA's best intentions to safeguard public health, Holmstead said it seems unlikely that regions already struggling to meet the current standards will be able to comply with stricter limits.

"It really forces regulators to be dishonest, because they have to come up with this modeling and these plans that purport to show that whatever they're doing is going to allow them in 10 years or in 20 years to meet the

standard," Holmstead said. "But everybody knows that they're not going to do that."

Baron dismissed that argument, saying that EPA must set a high bar in order to encourage innovation.

"We've had strong standards set in the past or standards that seemed to be strong that we've been able to meet," Baron said. "Unless you set protective targets, you're not going to generate the efforts to meet those standards."

Amy Chai, staff counsel for the National Association of Home Builders, said she is optimistic that the agency will relax the standards. The industry association sued the agency over the Bush administration rule, arguing that the ozone levels were too stringent and would prove costly to businesses.

"I remain hopeful, but you know I really don't know which way it's going go," Chai said. "Our concerns have always been that these requirements are going to lead to increased burdens on our industry."

The agency plans to issue a proposed rule by Dec. 21 and to sign the final rule by Aug. 31, 2010.

Advertisement

[E&E Home](#) | [About](#) | [Start a Trial](#) | [Get Email Alerts](#) | [Advertise](#) | [Staff Directory](#) | [Reports](#) | [RSS](#)

**E&E**NEWS

ENERGYWIRE

CLIMATEWIRE

E&EDAILY

GREENWIRE

E&E NEWS PM

E&ETV

*The essential news for energy & environment professionals*

© 1996-2017 Environment & Energy Publishing, LLC [Privacy Policy](#) [Site Map](#)

# Exhibit B





UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20460

JUL 13 2011

The Honorable Thomas R. Carper  
United States Senate  
Washington, D.C. 20510

THE ADMINISTRATOR

Dear Senator Carper:

Thank you for your letter of July 11, 2011, regarding the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency's reconsideration of the 2008 National Ambient Air Quality Standard (NAAQS) for ground-level ozone, which is commonly known as "smog." I appreciate the opportunity to clarify why the Agency is undertaking a reconsideration of the 2008 standard, which had been set by the previous Administration.

For more than 40 years, the Clean Air Act (CAA) has protected Americans against diseases from air pollution – guarding the public by setting national health standards based on the best science. The review of the ozone standard every five years, as demanded by the Clean Air Act, is particularly vital. Ozone is among the most widespread and stubborn air pollutants. It contributes to the smog which can shroud U.S. cities, fields and canyons. It is responsible for tens of thousands of visits to emergency rooms by Americans each year for serious bronchial conditions, including asthma. It is hardest on the breathing of the very old and the very young, but it can affect everyone. It is responsible for millions of lost days of school due to illness and damages vegetation in the United States -- an estimated \$500 million in reduced crop production each year.

The CAA sets up a two-step process for addressing unhealthy levels of six different air pollutants, including ozone. The first step is setting ambient air quality standards, which is the science-based step. The second step is reducing pollution levels to meet the standards; cost and other factors are considered in this step. Ozone pollution, or smog, is commonly associated with aggravated asthma attacks, but it also contributes to thousands of premature deaths a year, and millions of lost work and school days.

In setting the health-based ambient standards, Congress required EPA to review the best available science every 5 years and, if appropriate, revise the ambient standards to a level requisite to protect human health with an adequate margin of safety. The CAA requires that this standard setting be based solely on science. Since science is the cornerstone of all of our actions, we rely on the work of an independent, Congressionally-established body, the Clean Air Science Advisory Committee (CASAC), to review the work of the Agency health scientists and provide recommendations to the Agency on where protective standards ought to be set. This group is made up of wholly independent expert scientists, public health officials and other similar experts.

In the 2008 standard-setting process, the CASAC submitted recommendations to the Agency that a protective standard for ground-ozone would be appropriate within the range of 0.060-0.070 parts per million (ppm). However, the Bush EPA set the standard outside of the CASAC-recommended range, at 0.075 ppm. Based on arguments that the 0.075 ppm designation was "arbitrary and capricious" because it was not consistent with the recommendations of CASAC, the Bush-era EPA's decision was immediately challenged in court.

The legal defensibility of the 2008 decision posed major challenges for the Federal Government given the strength of the scientific record at the time, the weakness of the 2008 ozone decision in light of that scientific record and the requirements of the CAA, and other factors. Were the standard to be overturned in court, it would have resulted in more financial and planning uncertainty for Cities and States, when they could afford it the least.

Upon my confirmation as EPA Administrator, I had to choose between defending the Bush-era ozone standard in court or agreeing to reconsider the 2008 designation. I decided that reconsideration was the appropriate path based on concerns that the 2008 standards were not legally defensible given the scientific evidence in the record for the rulemaking, the requirements of the Clean Air Act and the recommendation of the CASAC. This reconsideration will be based on the scientific record that was the basis for the 2008 standard.

I am committed to working with states and local areas to provide healthy air to all Americans by identifying cost-effective implementation solutions to meet any revised standards. There is much flexibility in the Clean Air Act that EPA can build into implementation of the reconsidered ozone standard, and I recognize that this flexibility will be critical to states working under constrained resources to continue economic development and job growth.

As history has shown us, this flexibility will minimize the costs associated with updating the standard. In 1997, for instance, the Agency heard claims about excessively high costs and unreasonable burdens associated with meeting the standards we set at the time ozone and particulate matter. Critics said that the new EPA standards would result in banning barbecues, fireworks and antique cars, and have other serious effects on our society and that they would cost tens of billions of dollars a year and that many areas would never be able to attain the standards. In reality, it has cost a fraction of that amount, and the vast majority of areas around the country now meet those standards, or will as a result of the Cross-State Air Pollution Rule that we finalized last week.

Again, I thank you for your leadership and your inquiry. Should you have any further questions, please feel free to contact me.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'L. Jackson', written in a cursive, flowing style.

Lisa P. Jackson